Political Science Y673: An Introduction to Institutional Analysis and Development

Official Title: Topics in Empirical Theory and Methodology – Section 5193 Fall 2013, Meets Tuesday 10:00 AM - 12:00 Noon, Tocqueville Room, 513 N. Park

Instructor: Michael D. McGinnis,

Professor, Department of Political Science, Adjunct Faculty, School of Public and Environmental Affairs, and Senior Research Fellow, The Vincent and Elinor Ostrom Workshop in Political Theory and Policy Analysis Indiana University, Bloomington

Offices: Room 103, Park 3 (521 N. Park), and Room 366, Woodburn Hall

Contact: mcginnis@indiana.edu

Course website: https://oncourse.iu.edu/portal

Course Assistant: David Price, daaprice@indiana.edu, 513 N. Park

Course Description

This seminar introduces graduate students, visiting scholars, and other participants to the basic principles and selected applications of the "Bloomington School" of institutional analysis as developed by Vincent and Elinor (Lin) Ostrom and their many colleagues associated with the Ostrom Workshop in Political Theory and Policy Analysis.

A primary focus of this seminar is the Institutional Analysis and Development (IAD) framework, which was originally developed through extensive discussions among previous participants in this seminar, colloquium presentations, and in other Workshop projects. Although grounded in basic principles of individual choice within various types of institutional arrangements, the IAD framework was designed to facilitate communication among scholars trained in different disciplines. We will also cover a recent elaboration (the SES framework) designed for application to complex social-ecological systems. These frameworks have inspired research projects on diverse topics in political science, economics, and public policy, and several examples of these applications will be covered in this seminar. Many topics covered here in one week could well be the topic for a full semester's work. Once the

course is completed, the student will have been introduced to a diversity of questions and approaches, but will not yet have gained full mastery and will need substantial additional study to gain that mastery.

This seminar was originally developed and taught for many years by Lin Ostrom, who passed away in June 2012. This semester's version of the fall Workshop seminar will be led by Mike McGinnis, a Senior Research Fellow and former Director of the Ostrom Workshop. Y673 is listed as a Political Science seminar, but enrollment is open to students from all departments and schools. (Please contact Amanda Campbell, acperry@indiana.edu for permission to enroll for credit.) Another seminar may be offered in the spring, but that seminar will be focused on specialized topics; the fall Y673 is the only opportunity to get a broad overview of the Ostrom Workshop approach to institutional analysis.

This seminar meets weekly, on Tuesdays from 10 AM to Noon, in the Tocqueville Room at Park 1 (513 N. Park). Visiting Scholars are encouraged to participate regularly in these sessions, and to complete assigned readings before each class. Assigned readings will be uploaded to Oncourse (https://oncourse.iu.edu/portal), except for a few books available at the IU Bookstore for purchase (and also available on reserve in the Workshop Library). The specific schedule of readings varies each year, but the general structure remains pretty much the same – for previous syllabi see http://www.indiana.edu/~workshop/courses/Y673/pastsyllabi.php. The syllabus for this year's course will be finalized a week or so before classes begin. For this semester's version, particular emphasis will be placed on helping students and other participants to examine the extent to which either the IAD or SES frameworks might be useful for application to their own research interests.

Grades for students taking the course for credit will be based on three equally weighted components: (1) class participation, (2) memos, and (3) mini-conference paper. They should participate actively in all seminar sessions and complete two assignments.

- First, each student is expected to write a short (2-3 page) memo to the instructor and other members of the class every other week reflecting on what they are currently reading, how they are progressing on their seminar paper, and related topics. The faithfulness and quality of the memos will be reflected in this part of the grade. The schedule for memo assignments and deadlines will be negotiated during the initial class session.
- Second, a final paper is required. Each student will be expected to select either a type of problem (such as that of providing a
 particular type of public good or common-pool resource) or a type of decision-making arrangement (such as that of a
 legislature, a market structure, a cooperative organization or a common-property regime). The student will then undertake a
 micro-analysis of how combinations of rules, the structure of the goods and technology involved, and culture interact to

affect the incentives facing individuals and resulting patterns of interactions adopted by individuals in one or a set of closely related situations. The student may focus more on an operational, a collective-choice or a constitutional-choice level, but the linkage among these levels should be addressed. This is an excellent opportunity to do a research design for a dissertation that applies institutional analysis to a particular problem. Or students may wish to do the first draft of a paper that eventually will be submitted for publication. All papers will be presented at the Mini-Conference.

Mini-Conference, December 16-17.

Training scholars lies at the core of the Ostrom Workshop's educational mission. The culmination of each Y673 seminar is a miniconference. Students and visiting scholars write papers to be presented before their colleagues, by another colleague. This unusual practice is a locally-grown institution of the Ostrom Workshop, and we have found that this procedure ensures that the author receives quality comments and suggestions from several faculty members, fellow seminar participants, and other participants.

Paper presenters are assigned by the instructor based on paper topic and faculty willing and available to devote the time needed to carefully read a paper and participate in a mini-conference session. Papers are organized into panels including three or four papers. In each panel, each paper presenter has ten minutes to provide a sympathetic overview of the paper, and then five minutes to make constructive changes for improvement in the author's argument, analysis, or style. The paper author then has five minutes to respond to specific questions or to highlight themes that did not come through as clearly to the presenter. Another ten minutes is allotted for general questions from other session participants after each paper presentation, as well as 10-15 additional minutes at the conclusion of each panel. Panel chairs are assigned the task of keeping that session flowing smoothly and on time.

Most paper authors find that listening to someone else carefully summarizing their own line of argument to be a unique and rewarding experience, one that frequently helps the author make improvements in the next revision of that paper. And it gets them into the habit of careful reading and close listening to comments, essential skills for their future professional development.

The mini-conference is an intense but interesting event. Experience shows that this process can work well only if presenters are given sufficient lead time to read their assigned paper and prepare their presentation, so deadlines for completion of papers will be strictly enforced. The tentative deadline for submission of papers is Friday, Dec. 6, with the final details subject to later negotiations. It is strongly preferred that all session participants stay for the full session and potentially other sessions that may be of interest.

Reading Assignments and Discussion Topics

With the exception of assigned textbooks, all readings will be available in electronic format at the OnCourse website https://oncourse.iu.edu/portal.

Assigned textbooks (available for purchase and on reserve in Ostrom Workshop Library) include:

- Aligica, Paul Dragos, and Peter Boettke. 2009. *Challenging Institutional Analysis and Development: The Bloomington School*. Routledge.
- McGinnis, Michael D. ed. 1999. *Polycentricity and Local Public Economies: Readings from the Workshop in Political Theory and Policy Analysis*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Ostrom, Elinor. 1990. *Governing the Commons: The Evolution of Institutions for Collective Action.* New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Ostrom, Elinor. 2005. Understanding Institutional Diversity. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Ostrom, Vincent. 2008b. *The Political Theory of a Compound Republic: Designing the American Experiment*. 3rd ed. Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Poteete, Amy, Marco Janssen, and Elinor Ostrom. 2010. *Working Together: Collective Action, the Commons, and Multiple Methods in Practice.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Date & Topic	Reading Assignments
1. Aug. 27 Introduction to Seminar	Searle, John R. 1969. "The Distinction Between Brute and Institutional Facts," in Speech Acts: An Essay in the Philosophy of Language, Cambridge University Press, pp. 50-52. EO, selections from her last Y673 syllabus, Fall 2011 (Other past syllabi available at http://www.indiana.edu/~workshop/courses/Y673/pastsyllabi.php) McGinnis, Michael D. 2013. "Updated Guide to IAD and the Language of the Ostrom Workshop: A Simplified Overview of a Complex Framework for the Analysis of Institutions and Their Development," http://php.indiana.edu/~mcginnis/iad_guide.pdf
2. Sept. 3 A Nobel Prize for "economic governance, especially the commons"	VO, Charles M. Tiebout, and Robert Warren. 1961. "The Organization of Government in Metropolitan Areas: A Theoretical Inquiry." American Political Science Review 55 (4), 831–42. Reprinted in McGinnis, Polycentricity and Local Public Economies, chapter 1. EO, Governing the Commons EO. 2010. "Beyond Markets and States: Polycentric Governance of Complex Economic Systems," American Economic Review, 100(3) (June 2010): 641–72. [Published version of Lin's 2009 Nobel lecture] For additional material related to Lin's Nobel, see http://www.indiana.edu/~workshop/news/nobel.php
3. Sept. 10 Institutional Design for Citizenship and Scholarship	 VO, 1980. "Artisanship and Artifact." Public Administration Review 40(4) (July-Aug.): 309-17. EO, "A Frequently Overlooked Precondition of Democracy: Citizens Knowledgeable About and Engaged in Collective Action." In Preconditions of Democracy, The Tampere Club Series, vol. 2, ed. Geoffrey Brennan, 75–89. Tampere, Finland: Tampere University Press, 2006. Aligicia, Paul. "Rethinking Institutional Analysis: Interviews with Vincent and Elinor Ostrom," Commemorating a Lifetime of Achievement, George Mason University, Mercatus Center, Nov. 7, 2003. VO. "Interpreting Social Experiments: An Agenda for Critical Reflections and Inquiry About a Research Program in Comparative Institutional Analysis and Development," in The Quest to Understand Human Affairs, Vol II, ed. by Barbara Allen. Lexington Books (2012), pp. 297-322. EO, "A Long Polycentric Journey." Annual Review of Political Science 13 (May 2010): 1–23.

	EO. "Ventures in Teaching and Research," Indiana University <i>The Review</i> 16 (Winter 1974): 10–17.
4. Sept. 17	McGinnis, Polycentricity and Local Public Economies, entire
Police Studies and Beyond	Aligica & Boettke, Challenging Institutional Analysis and Development: The Bloomington School, Part I
	Boettke, Peter, Liya Palagashvli, and Jayme Lemke. 2013. "Riding in cars with boys: Elinor Ostrom's adventures with the police," Journal of Institutional Economics
	EO. 1986. "A Method of Institutional Analysis." In Guidance, Control, and Evaluation in the Public Sector, ed. F. X. Kaufmann, G. Majone, and V. Ostrom, 459–75. Berlin and New York: de Gruyter. VO and EO. "The Quest for Meaning in Public Choice". American Journal of Economics and Sociology 63(1) (January
	2004): 105–47. EO. 2011. "Background on the Institutional Analysis and Development Framework." <i>Policy Studies Journal</i> 39(1) (February 2011): 7–27.
5. Sept. 24	Agrawal, Arun. 2003. "Sustainable Governance of Common-Pool Resources: Context, Methods, and Politics," Annual Review of Anthropology 32 : 234–262.
Building	
Frameworks for Analysis	Anderies, John M. Marco Janssen and Elinor Ostrom, "A Framework to Analyze the Robustness of Social-Ecological Systems from an Institutional Perspective," <i>Ecology & Society</i> 9(1)(June 2004):18.
	EO, 2007. A Diagnostic Approach for Going Beyond Panaceas. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i> , 104(39), 15181–15187.
	EO, 2009. "A General Framework for Analyzing Sustainability of Social-Ecological Systems," <i>Science</i> , 325 (5939), 419–422.
	McGinnis, Michael D. and Elinor Ostrom, "SES Framework: Initial Changes and Continuing Challenges," under review, <i>Ecology and Society</i> . Working Paper W11-6, Ostrom Workshop, Indiana University, April 15, 2013.

	Lave, Charles A., and James G. March. 1975. <i>An Introduction to Models in the Social Sciences,</i> chapters 1-3, pp. 1-84. New York: Harper & Row.
	McGinnis, "How To Use the IAD Framework," http://php.indiana.edu/~mcginnis/howtouseIAD.pdf
	Cox, Michael, Gwen Arnold, and Sergio Villamayor Tomás. 2010. "A Review of Design Principles for Community-Based Natural Resource Management." <i>Ecology and Society</i> 15(4):38
6. Oct. 1	Gutiérrez, N., R. Hilborn, and O. Defeo. 2011. Leadership, social capital and incentives promote successful fisheries. <i>Nature</i> 470:386–389.
Examples of	
Research Questions	Gibson, Clark, John T. Williams, and Elinor Ostrom, "Local Enforcement and Better Forests," World Development 33(2) (2005):273-84.
Using IAD	Elinor Ostrom and Harini Nagendra, "Insights on Linking Forests, Trees, and People from the Air, on the Ground, and in the Laboratory," <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i> 103(51) (2006): 19224–31.
	Andersson, Krister and Elinor Ostrom. "Analyzing Decentralized Resource Regimes from a Polycentric Perspective, Policy Sciences 41 (2008):71–93.
	Van Laerhoven, Frank, and Krister P. Andersson. "The Virtue of Conflict: An Institutional Approach to the Study of Conflict in Community Forest Governance," International Forestry Review, 15(1):122-135. 2013.
7. Oct. 8	EO. "Multiorganizational Arrangements and Coordination: An Application of Institutional Analysis." In <i>Guidance, Control, and Evaluation in the Public Sector,</i> ed. F. X. Kaufmann, G. Majone, and V. Ostrom, 495–510. Berlin and New York: de Gruyter, 1986.
7. Oct. 6	McGinnis, Michael D. "Networks of Adjacent Action Situations in Polycentric Governance," <i>Policy Studies Journal</i>
More	39 (1) (Feb. 2011), 45-72.
Examples of	
Research	EO. 2009. "A Polycentric Approach for Coping with Climate Change." Policy Research Working Paper No. 5095. DC:
and/or Policy	The World Bank.
Questions	Cox, Michael, Sarah Mincey, Tatyana Ruseva, Sergio Villamayor-Tomas, and Burney Fischer. 2013. "Evaluating the USFS State and Private Forestry Redesign: A First Look at Policy Implications," <i>Ecological Economics</i> 85 (January): 35–42.
	Zamagni, Vera Negri. 2012. "Interpreting the Roles and Economic Importance of Cooperative Enterprises in a Historical Perspective," Journal of Entrepreneurial and Organizational Diversity, 1 (1), 21-36.

8. Oct. 15	EO. "An Agenda for the Study of Institutions," <i>Public Choice</i> 42(1986):3-25. VO and EO, "Public Goods and Public Choices," In <i>Alternatives for Delivering Public Services. Toward Improved Performance</i> , ed. E. S. Savas, 7-49. Boulder, CO: Westview Press. Reprinted in McGinnis, <i>Polycentricity and Local Public Economies</i> .
Property and Other	EO. "How Types of Goods and Property Rights Jointly Affect Collective Action," <i>Journal of Theoretical Politics</i> 15(3) (July 2003): 239–70.
Collective Choice	Elinor Ostrom and Edella Schlager. "Property-Rights Regimes and Natural Resources: A Conceptual Analysis," Land Economics 68(3) (August 1992): 249–62.
Institutions	Cole, Daniel H. and Elinor Ostrom. "The Variety of Property Systems and Rights in Natural Resources," in <i>Property in Land and Other Resources</i> , ed., D.H. Cole and E. Ostrom, Cambridge, MA: Lincoln Institute of Land Policy, pp. 37–64.
9. Oct. 22	
Advanced Institutional Analysis	EO, Understanding Institutional Diversity, entire
10. Oct. 29 Panels	Meet to discuss research designs and methods for papers (review Lave-March and McGinnis, How to Use IAD)
11. Nov. 5	Poteete, Janssen, and Elinor Ostrom. Working Together, entire
Building Research Programs	Ahn, T. K., Elinor Ostrom, and James Walker. 2010. "A Common-Pool Resource Experiment with Postgraduate Subjects from 41 Countries," <i>Ecological Economics</i> 69(12) (October): 2624–33.

	VO, The Political Theory of a Compound Republic, entire
12. Nov. 12	EO, 1989. "Microconstitutional Change in Multiconstitutional Political Systems." Rationality and Society 1(1): 11-50.
Polycentricity	
in America	Review OTW (in McGinnis, Polycentricity and Local Public Economies)
	McGinnis, Michael D. and Elinor Ostrom, "Reflections on Vincent Ostrom, Public Administration, and Polycentricity," <i>Public Administration Review</i> 72(2012): 15-25.
13. Nov. 19	McGinnis, Michael D. "Caring for the Health Commons: What It Is and Who's Responsible For It," Working Paper
Application to	W13-5, April 13, 2013.
U.S. Health	McGinnis, How to Use the IAD Framework, online Review EO, Governing the Commons, chapter 6
Policy	
	Thanksgiving Break
	Aligica & Boettke, Challenging Institutional Analysis and Development: The Bloomington School, Parts II-III
14. Dec. 3	Geller, Sheldon, "Tocquevillian Analytics and the Global Democratic Revolution," in <i>Conversations with Tocqueville</i> , A. Craiutu and S. Geller, eds., Lexington Books (2009), pp. 33-44.
Tocarrovillian	Sawyer, Amos. 2004. "Violent Conflicts and Governance Challenges in West Africa: The Case of the Mano River
Tocquevillian Analytics	Basin Area." Journal of Modern African Studies 42(3):437–63.
	MINI-CONFERENCE PAPER DUE FRIDAY, DECEMBER 6

15. Dec. 10 IAD in Context & Course evaluations	Aligica & Boettke, Challenging Institutional Analysis and Development: The Bloomington School, Postscript Mitchell, William C. "Virginia, Rochester, and Bloomington: Twenty-Five Years of Public Choice and Political Science," Public Choice 56(2)(1988): 101-19 Clement, Floriane. 2010. "Analysing Decentralised Natural Resource Governance: Proposition for a "Politicised" Institutional Analysis and Development Framework," Policy Sciences 43(2): 129-156 Crosby, Barbara C., and John M. Bryson. 2010. "Integrative Leadership and the Creation and Maintenance of Cross- Sector Collaborations," The Leadership Quarterly 21: 211-230. Feiock, Richard C. 2009. "Metropolitan Governance and Institutional Collective Action." Urban Affairs Review 44(3): 356-77. Paul Pierson. 2003. "Big, Slow-Moving, and Invisible: Macrosocial Processes in the Study of Comparative Politics," in Comparative Historical Analysis in the Social Sciences, edited by James Mahoney, Dietrich Rueschemeyer, Cambridge, 177-207.
Dec. 16-17	Mini-Conference

Abbreviations used in reading list:

EO: Elinor Ostrom,

IAD: Institutional Analysis and Development Framework

OTW: Ostrom, Tiebout, and Warren, 1961. SES: Social-Ecological Systems Framework

VO: Vincent Ostrom