

## Political Science Y394: Public Policy Analysis Sustainable Governance in the Ostrom Tradition

**Prof. Michael McGinnis**

Professor, Political Science and  
Director, Workshop in Political Theory and Policy Analysis  
366 Woodburn Hall

### Office Hours:

Tuesday, Thursday 9:30-10:30 AM  
or by appointment  
[mcginnis@indiana.edu](mailto:mcginnis@indiana.edu)

Meets TR 11:15-12:30, WH 120  
Section 30318 – Fall 2010

Re-Updated November 18, 2010

Ever wonder how **Elinor Ostrom**, an *IU political scientist*, could have won the **2009 Nobel Prize in Economics**? Here's your chance to find out, in a course taught by the current Director of the **Workshop in Political Theory and Policy Analysis** here in Bloomington.

Students taking this course will learn at least 4 things. First, everyone who knows her calls her **Lin**. Second, Lin won this prize for her demonstration of the remarkable ability of local communities throughout the world to manage resources critical to their own survival, and to do so in a long-term and **sustainable** manner. (Yes, this course is related to the College's **Themester**.) Third, Lin's explanation of the conditions that support such success is rooted in broader principles of democratic governance, best exemplified in the work of her long-time collaborator and spouse **Vincent Ostrom**. Fourth, these same basic principles are potentially relevant to a broad array of research topics and policy issues.

The Ostroms established the Workshop in Political Theory and Policy Analysis in 1973 as an interdisciplinary research and teaching center focused on the study of institutions, development, and governance. Recently, those of us around the Workshop have begun using the term "**Ostrom Workshop**" as an informal label for this research program. Students are encouraged to check out materials posted on the Workshop's website, at <http://www.indiana.edu/~workshop/>, which includes the following mission statement:

The mission of the Ostrom Workshop is to promote the interdisciplinary study of institutions, incentives, and behavior as they relate to policy-relevant applications. The term 'workshop' represents our conviction that the skills needed for this research are best acquired and used in a setting where students, working as apprentices and journeymen, have the opportunity to collaborate with experienced scholars. The central themes of Workshop research include self-governance and democratic reform, as well as collective action in the context of sustainable natural resources.

The primary goal of this course is to enable undergraduate students to begin to understand how the abstract principles behind the analysis that won Lin this prize might be applied to other areas of public policy. Each student will write a paper (in three parts) applying these general principles to some particular policy topic that he or she considers to be especially important.

Before completing this assignment, they will examine two books: *Governing the Commons*, Lin's most influential and accessible book, and Vincent's *The Political Theory of a Compound Republic*, a careful examination of the logic behind the writing of the U.S. Constitution, as well as several articles and working papers on various topics researched by Lin and her Workshop colleagues. (All of these additional readings will be available in electronic format.) We will pay particular attention to working through Lin's Nobel Prize speech in some detail, since it provides a summary overview of nearly four decades of research. (For additional information about her prize, see <http://www.indiana.edu/~workshop/news/nobel.php>.)

The instructor will work to convince Lin to join our class for at least one session, but the demands on her time are overwhelming. This class is a unique opportunity for students to learn about an exciting and on-going research program that has only recently become widely recognized as truly path-breaking.

### **Student Responsibilities and Grading Criteria**

**This course is primarily conceptual in focus.** Most class sessions will be devoted to presentation and discussion of analytical tools and concepts used in the study of public policy, institutions, and governance. **Students will be asked to apply these abstract principles of institutional analysis to a specific area of public policy of particular interest to them.**

**There are no exams scheduled for this course.** Students will demonstrate their level of understanding of the course material by completing these written assignments and by their participation in class discussions. The paper will be submitted in three parts, worth 20, 25, and 40 percent of the grade, respectively. Each student's participation in class discussion (including in-class exercises) will determine the remaining 15%. Students should avoid missing many class sessions; please let the instructor know when you have a valid reason to miss class.

**Students will do well in this course only if they complete the assigned readings before each class session.** Students will, of course, have to locate other readings relevant to their paper topics. The instructor will be happy to offer advice on where to find appropriate readings.

Details on the format for the **paper** will be distributed later in the semester, but students should plan on completing a paper of approximately 15-20 double-spaced pages in total. This paper will consist of three parts.

1. In the first part, students will be asked to clarify which aspects of their chosen topic most closely resemble problems associated with management of the commons, the subject of the first part of the course. **DUE Oct. 5**
2. In the second part, students should give an overview of the diverse array of public, private, and voluntary organizations that are most directly relevant to the implementation of policy in a substantive area of their own interest. Common course readings for this part of the course will

introduce students to the basic concepts required to identify and understand these policy networks. **DUE NOV. 9**

3. The final version of the paper should add concluding analyses of the threats to sustainability that confront policy makers in that area of public policy. Again, the common readings for that part of the course focus on threats to sustainability and the range of appropriate responses to these threats. **DUE DEC. 14**

By the end of this semester each student should have written an original analysis of a particular topic in public policy, a paper well-suited for submission as a writing sample for application to graduate schools or as the basis for more detailed analysis in later courses. Appropriate use of relevant course material will be the primary basis for the assignment of a grade to the final paper. The paper should also develop a coherent argument, and fit together as a whole. (More details will be provided later.)

## SCHEDULE OF TOPICS AND READING ASSIGNMENTS

Note: This schedule is subject to revisions during the semester; changes will be negotiated in class and announced via OnCourse.

### 1. A Nobel Prize for Commons Research

**Aug. 31:** Tuesday's session will consist of a brief overview of the course plan.

**Sept. 2:** Thursday we will watch Elinor Ostrom's Nobel Prize Lecture, given in Stockholm, Sweden, on December 8, 2009, <http://nobelprize.org/mediaplayer/index.php?id=1223>

- Students should come to Thursday's class with a copy of the [PDF of the PowerPoint presentation](#) Lin used for her lecture.
- Students will be encouraged to ask questions during and/or after this presentation.
- Supplemental material: An archived stream of a different version of Elinor Ostrom's Nobel Prize Lecture (but based on the same set of slides), as delivered at the Indiana University Auditorium, Bloomington, IN, on February 16, 2010, can be viewed at: <http://broadcast.iu.edu/lectures/ostrom/index.html>. For additional information, including the announcement and overviews the Prize Committee prepared for the general public and the scientific community, see [http://nobelprize.org/nobel\\_prizes/economics/laureates/2009/](http://nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/economics/laureates/2009/)
- For the article version of Lin's Nobel speech, see "[Beyond Markets and States: Polycentric Governance of Complex Economic Systems.](#)" *American Economic Review* 100(3) (June 2010): 641–72. This paper is also listed below as a reading for the

For reference throughout the semester:

McGinnis, Michael. 2010. "[An Introduction to IAD and the Language of the Ostrom Workshop: A Simple Guide to a Complex Framework for the Analysis of Institutions and their Development.](#)" Presented at the Institutional Analysis and Development symposium, University of Colorado, Denver, April 9-10, 2010.

Note: Students are encouraged to make suggestions for improvement in this document, as this is very much a work in progress. If any point remains unclear, please contact the instructor with suggestions for changes.

**Sept. 7, 9, 14:** Foundations of Institutional Analysis

- Ostrom, Elinor. 1990. *Governing the Commons: The Evolution of Institutions for Collective Action*. New York: Cambridge University Press, Chapters 1-2 (pp. 1-57)
- Ostrom, Elinor. 2003. "How Types of Goods and Property Rights Jointly Affect Collective Action," *Journal of Theoretical Politics* 15 (3), 239-270.

**Sept. 16, 21, 23:** Learning from Examples of Successful Collective Action

- Ostrom, Elinor. *Governing the Commons*, Chapter 3-4 (pp. 58-142)

**Sept. 28, 30:** Conclusions and Recent Elaborations

- Ostrom, Elinor. *Governing the Commons*, Chapter 5-6 (pp. 143-216)
- [Optional] Cox, Michael, Gwen Arnold, and Sergio Villamayor Tomás. 2009. "A Review and Reassessment of Design Principles for Community-Based Natural Resource Management." Submitted to *Ecology & Society*. Or Cox, Michael, Gwen Arnold, and Sergio Villamayor Tomas. 2009. "[Design Principles are Not Blueprints, but are They Robust? A Meta-Analysis of 112 Studies.](#)" Working Paper. Cambridge, MA: Lincoln Institute of Land Policy

**Oct. 5:** Revisiting the Tragedy

- Hardin, Garrett. 1968. "The Tragedy of the Commons," *Science* 162 (13 December 1968), 1243-1248.

**Oct. 5: First Paper Due** (beginning of class); discussion during class

## **2. American Federalism and Polycentric Governance**

**Oct. 7, 12:** Introducing Polycentric Governance

- Ostrom, Vincent, Charles M. Tiebout, and Robert Warren. 1961. "[The Organization of Government in Metropolitan Areas: A Theoretical Inquiry.](#)" *American Political Science Review* 55 (Dec.): 831-42.
- Ostrom, Elinor. 1998. "[The Comparative Study of Public Economies.](#)" Acceptance paper for the Frank E. Seidman Distinguished Award in Political Economy, Rhodes College, Memphis, TN, September 26, 1997. Memphis, TN: P.K. Seidman Foundation, 1-66.
- [Optional] Hooghe, Liesbet, and Gary Marks. 2003. "Unraveling the Central State, but How? Types of Multi-Level Governance." *American Political Science Review* 97(2): 233-43.

**Oct. 14, 19:** How Are We to Understand Constitutional Order?

- Ostrom, Vincent. 1995. "Where to Begin?" *Publius* 25 (2), 45-60
- Ostrom, Vincent. 2008. *The Political Theory of a Compound Republic: Designing the American Experiment*. 3d ed. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books. Previous editions 1971 (Virginia Polytechnic Institute), 1987 (U. Nebraska Press).  
Foreword, Preface, chapters 1-7 (pp. ix-130).

**Oct. 21, 26, 28:** Polycentricity in Practice

Peters, B. Guy. 2007. "The Structure of Policymaking in American Government," *American Public Policy: Promise and Performance*, 7<sup>th</sup> edition, chapter 2, pp. 21-43.

Anderson, James E. 2006. "Policy Implementation," *Public Policymaking: An Introduction*, 6<sup>th</sup> edition, chapter 6 (selections), pp. 200-220.

O'Toole, Laurence J., Jr. 2000. "American Intergovernmental Relations: An Overview," in L.J. O'Toole, Jr., ed., *American Intergovernmental Relations: Foundations, Perspectives, and Issues*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edition, CQ Press, pp. 1-31.

**Nov. 2, 4:** Policy Tools and Multi-Sector Governance

Salamon, Lester M. 2002. "The New Governance and the Tools of Public Action: An Introduction," in Lester M. Salamon, ed., *The Tools of Government: A Guide to the New Governance*, Oxford University Press, pp. 1-47.

**Nov. 9:** Is Polycentricity Sustainable?

**Nov. 11: NO CLASS (Health Commons Meeting)**

**Nov. 16: NO CLASS; Second paper due**

**3. Challenges of Sustainability in Diverse Policy Areas**

**Nov. 18:** Sustainability of Policy Networks

**Nov. 23:** Optional Class Session

1. Students may ask for assistance in their paper project
2. Discussion of application to Health Policy

[Optional] McGinnis, Michael, et al. 2010. "Managing the Health Commons," a research proposal submitted to the Rippel Foundation, Nov. 2010

[Optional] Nichols, Len M., Micah Weinberg, and Julie Barnes. 2009. *Grand Junction, Colorado: A Health Community That Works*, New America Foundation, Health Policy Program, <http://www.newamerica.net>

**THANKSGIVING BREAK**

**Nov. 30: NO CLASS (SES Club Meeting)**

**Dec. 2:** Sustainability as a Challenge to Democracy

Ostrom, Vincent. *Political Theory of a Compound Republic*, ch. 8-10 (pp. 133-247)

Carpenter, Daniel. 2005. "The Evolution of National Bureaucracy in the United States," in Joel D. Aberbach and Mark A. Peterson, eds., *The Executive Branch*, Oxford University Press, pp. 41-71.

**Dec. 7, 9:** Sustainability in Coupled Human-Environmental Systems (or SESs)

Dietz, Thomas, Elinor Ostrom, and Paul Stern. 2003. "[The Struggle to Govern the Commons.](#)" *Science* 302 (special issue, December 12): 1907-12.

- Ostrom, Elinor. 2007. "[A Diagnostic Approach for Going Beyond Panaceas.](#)" *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 104(39):15181–87.
- Ostrom, Elinor. 2009. "[A General Framework for Analyzing Sustainability of Social-Ecological Systems.](#)" *Science* 325(5939) (July 24): 419–22.

#### **Unable to Arrange Visit by Prof. Elinor Ostrom**

##### **Optional readings**

- Ostrom, Elinor. 2010. "[A Long Polycentric Journey.](#)" *Annual Review of Political Science* 13 (May): 1–23. This link also includes an informal interview with the editor.
- Ostrom, Elinor. 2010. "[Beyond Markets and States: Polycentric Governance of Complex Economic Systems.](#)" *American Economic Review* 100(3) (June): 641–72. [Revised version of Nobel lecture delivered in Stockholm, Sweden, on December 8, 2009.]
- Fleischman, F. D., K. Boenning, G. A. Garcia-Lopez, S. Mincey, M. Schmitt-Harsh, K. Daedlow, M. Lopez, X. Basurto, B. Fischer, and E. Ostrom. 2010. Disturbance, response, and persistence in self-organized forested communities: analysis of robustness and resilience in five communities in southern Indiana. *Ecology and Society* 15(4): 9. [online] URL: <http://www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol15/iss4/art9/>
- Davis, Gina, and Elinor Ostrom. 1991. "[A Public Economy Approach to Education: Choice and Co-Production.](#)" *International Political Science Review* 12(4) (Oct.): 313-35.
- Bard, Joe, Clark Gardener, and Regi Wieland. 2005. "[Rural School Consolidation Report,](#)" prepared by the NREA Consolidation Task Force for the National Rural Education Association Executive Board, April 1-2, 2005.
- Ostrom, Elinor. 2010. "[Polycentric Systems for Coping with Collective Action and Global Environmental Change.](#)" *Global Environmental Change*, Online First, August 3, 2010. Forthcoming in 20th anniversary issue of *Global Environmental Change* (October).

**Final Paper due Tuesday, Dec. 14, 5 PM** (Earlier submissions will be much appreciated).

**Course Rules and Procedures, Michael D. McGinnis**  
Professor, Department of Political Science, College of Arts and Sciences  
Indiana University, Bloomington

This page lists the policies and procedures in effect for my undergraduate courses at Indiana University. (I apologize for the officious tone, but I have learned that making these things explicit at the outset is a good idea for all.) For information on other applicable rules, students are encouraged to consult the appropriate sources in this department, college, campus, and university. Also, please feel free to speak with me if you have any questions or concerns.

*General Contact Information*

- Students are encouraged to check [On Course](#) regularly for course announcements. The official course syllabus posted there will be updated to reflect any changes.
- All *changes* to the schedule of assignments will be announced well in advance. No changes to due dates of assignments will be made without approval of the class.
- My office hours are available for drop-ins or appointments. *Appointments* are also available at other times in the week.
- The easiest ways to contact me are (1) see me before or after class, (2) by e-mail ([mcginnis@indiana.edu](mailto:mcginnis@indiana.edu)).

*During Class*

- Students are expected to come to class every day and to complete assignments on time. Attendance will be taken at irregular intervals, usually at the *beginning* of the period. Students arriving late may not be counted as present.
- Class discussion is encouraged and questions are always welcomed. Don't be deterred by concern that you are asking a "stupid question." If you are confused or uncertain over some point, it is almost always the case that several other students are having the same problems or confusion. If in doubt, just raise your hand.
- Comments in class must remain respectful of other people's opinions. Be assured that this requirement applies to the instructor just as much as to any student. Please let me know if you feel any comments in class have been unfair to you or to anyone else.
- Please try to arrive to class on time. Late arrivals can be very disruptive, especially if they to make their way to the middle of a row to find an open seat. As noted, above, students arriving late may not be counted as present if attendance is taken that day.
- If you know you are going to have to leave class early, please let me know at the beginning of class and sit near the exit so you can leave with as little disruption as possible.
- Please refrain from talking to each other during class. This can be very distracting to other students and to the instructor. (Be advised that this is one of your instructor's pet peeves!)
- **TURN OFF ALL CELL PHONES AND BEEPERS.** (This is another of my pet peeves!) If you expect to receive an important call during class time, please sit where you can exit the room without too much disruption.
- **Students have permission to use laptops during class to take notes BUT NOT FOR ANY OTHER PURPOSES.** Students using laptops to surf the web or answer e-mail or that in any way distract other students or the instructor will be asked to turn off their computer and pay attention, or else leave the classroom.

## Grading Procedures

- Numerical grades will be assigned for each exam and major assignment. (Quizzes or in-class assignments may be graded as acceptable, not acceptable, or not submitted.) At the end of the semester, an overall score will be calculated according to the weighting scheme specified in the syllabus.
- Final letter grades will be assigned based on these overall scores. In making these assignments, I use the standard numbering system (A+ 100-98, A 97-93, A- 92-90, B+ 89-88, B 87-83, B- 82-80, etc.) as a basis, but may make adjustments (upwards) as necessary. For example, an overall average of 80 will be awarded at least a grade of B-, but the threshold for that letter grade may be reduced, depending on the distribution of overall scores.
- I am willing to re-grade any assignment, as long as the student can provide a compelling reason to do so. (Just “needing” a higher grade is not a good enough reason.) Upon re-evaluation, the grade may be revised upwards or downwards or it may remain the same, whichever is appropriate.

## Assignments

- On exams, papers, and other assignments, each student is expected to complete his or her own work. Students caught *cheating* on exams or committing plagiarism in papers (misrepresenting someone else's work as your own) will receive a failing grade for that assignment and may be subject to additional disciplinary procedures (including failing the course). If you use the words of another, you need to give that author credit by the use of quotation marks and appropriate citations. For additional information, see <http://www.indiana.edu/~wts/pamphlets/plagiarism.shtml> .
- I am not a stickler for any one citation style. My primary concern is that references be sufficiently clear, unambiguous, and complete to allow a reader to track these sources down with minimal trouble. It also helps if the citations are relatively consistent within any single report. Information on acceptable citation styles is available at [http://www.indiana.edu/~wts/pamphlets/apa\\_style.shtml](http://www.indiana.edu/~wts/pamphlets/apa_style.shtml)
- Citations to material found on-line should include the author (or organizational source if no individual author is provided), the organization responsible for maintaining this site or for responsible for this particular information (if discernable), the date the information was posted or last revised (if available), the date the website was accessed, and the complete URL address. More detailed suggestions are provided by the IU Library at <http://www.indiana.edu/~libugls/Publications/APA.html>.
- The **IU Writing Tutorial Service** is an outstanding resource for information and advice concerning writing and editing papers; check their web page at <http://www.indiana.edu/~wts/>

This version revised November 18, 2010